Transcriptome Analysis of Apple Leaves Infected by the Rust Fungus *Gymnosporangium yamadae* at Two Sporulation Stages

Si-Qi Tao,^{1,2} Lucas Auer,² Emmanuelle Morin,² Ying-Mei Liang,^{3,†} and Sébastien Duplessis^{2,†}

¹ The Key Laboratory for Silviculture and Conservation of Ministry of Education, Beijing Forestry University, Beijing 100083, China

² Université de Lorraine, INRAE, Unité Mixte de Recherche 1136 Interactions Arbres-Microorganismes, 54280, Champenoux, France

³ Museum of Beijing Forestry University, Beijing Forestry University

Accepted 25 November 2019.

Apple rust disease caused by *Gymnosporangium yamadae* is one of the major threats to apple orchards. In this study, dual RNA-seq analysis was conducted to simultaneously monitor gene expression profiles of *G. yamadae* and infected apple leaves during the formation of rust spermogonia and aecia. The molecular mechanisms underlying this compatible interaction at 10 and 30 days postinoculation (dpi) indicate a significant reaction from the host plant and comprise detoxication pathways at the earliest stage and the induction of secondary metabolism pathways at 30 dpi. Such host reactions have been previously reported in other rust pathosystems and may represent a general reaction to rust infection. *G. yamadae* transcript profiling indicates a conserved genetic program in spermogonia and aecia that is shared with other rust fungi, whereas secretome prediction reveals the presence of specific secreted candidate effector proteins expressed during apple infection. Unexpectedly, the survey of fungal unigenes in the transcriptome assemblies of inoculated and mock-inoculated apple leaves reveals that *G. yamadae* infection may modify the fungal community composition in the apple phyllosphere at 30 dpi. Collectively, our results provide novel insights into the compatible apple–*G. yamadae* interaction and advance the knowledge of this heteroecious demicyclic rust fungus.

Keywords: dual RNA-seq, obligate biotrophy, plant secondary metabolism, Pucciniales, secreted proteins, phyllosphere microbiome

Apple (*Malus domestica* Borkh.), one of the major fruitful and economic fruiters in temperate regions of the world, is susceptible to the rust pathogen *Gymnosporangium yamadae* (Cummins and Hiratsuka 2003; Kern 1973; Peterson 1967). Heavy infection can lead to significant decreases in fruit yield and economic losses in most apple-planting regions in Asia (Kim and Kim 1980; Wang et al. 2010). As a heteroecious and demicyclic rust fungus, *G. yamadae* produces four morphologically different spores on two taxonomically different hosts (*Malus* spp. and *Juniperus chinensis*) to complete its life cycle (Kern 1973; Yun et al. 2005). In early spring, telia germinate and produce gelatinous tendrils containing haploid basidiospores that can disperse into the air. The released spores parasitize the surface of *Malus* leaves and successful infection leads to orange-yellow spots on the upper surface. Then the spots turn to a bright orange-red with a red border and may exhibit small raised black dots in the center of the spots. These lesions grow through the leaf and develop small brownish and spiky projections on the lower surface of leaf (Cummins and Hiratsuka 2003).

In Asia, junipers are widely cultivated and frequently found in graveyards, parks, and roadsides. Transprovincial transportation of juniper seedlings with overwintering fungal infections increases the risk of disease occurrence (Tao et al. 2018). Twenty *Malus* spp. have been tested for disease resistance and only *M. halliana* showed high resistance to *G. yamadae* basidiospores, the others all are highly susceptible (Harada 1984). To control this disease, protective fungicides are applied on apple leaves to prevent penetration of basidiospores into the host (Guo 1994), and the control efficiency is influenced by the timing of the spraying. Still, no effective management strategy has been established because the molecular mechanisms underlying the apple–*Gymnosporangium* interaction has not been investigated, and the fungal parasitic factors still remain unknown.

In the past few years, transcriptomic and bioinformatic approaches have allowed the identification of candidate virulence factors of many rust fungi at different infection or life-cycle stages (Lorrain et al. 2019). Similarly, efforts have been made for the identification of host defense mechanisms activated in response to rust infection at a transcriptomic scale (Rinaldi

All raw sequence data generated in this study has been deposited in the National Center for Biotechnology Information Sequence Read Archive (available online) under accession number SRR9326001 to SRR9326012.

†Corresponding authors: Y.-M. Liang; liangym@bjfu.edu.cn and S. Duplessis; sebastien.duplessis@inra.fr

Funding: This work was financed by the National Natural Science Foundation of China (number 31870628). The authors acknowledge the financial support from China Scholarship Council (number 201806510009) for the joint PhD program between Beijing Forestry University and INRAE, Champenoux, France. S. Duplessis is supported by the French Agence Nationale de la Recherche ‘Investissements d’Avenir’ program (ANR-11-LABX-0002-01, Lab of Excellence ARBRE).

*The e-Xtra logo stands for “electronic extra” and indicates that seven supplementary figures and three supplementary tables are published online.

The author(s) declare no conflict of interest.

© 2020 The American Phytopathological Society

et al. 2007; Schneider et al. 2011; Ullah et al. 2019; van de Mortel et al. 2007). Dual RNA-seq has been applied to simultaneously detect gene expression changes in both host and pathogens, including plant-rust fungi interactions (Dobon et al. 2016; Fernandez et al. 2012; Kawahara et al. 2012; Teixeira et al. 2014; Westermann et al. 2017). Such studies provided invaluable resources in identifying host molecular alterations during direct fungal action and to better understand the strategies used by the pathogen to manipulate the host during the infection process.

In addition to pathogenic fungi, the plant phyllosphere harbors large numbers of other microbiota, such as bacteria, nonpathogenic fungi, and archaea (Lindow and Brandl 2003; Vorholt 2012). Among these microbiotas, some play a direct role in protecting their host against pathogens (Hassani et al. 2018). Massive parallel sequencing technologies are remarkable tools to describe the in-depth composition and structure of microbial communities associated with leaves of many plants, including apple (Aglar et al. 2016; Becker et al. 2008; Camatti-Sartori et al. 2005; Leveau and Tech 2011; Reisberg et al. 2012). However, the systematic exploration of phyllosphere fungal communities remains limited and only a few reports have shown that microbes from the plant phyllosphere could

play an important role in resistance to pathogens (Busby et al. 2016; Hassani et al. 2018; Ritpitakphong et al. 2016; Vogel et al. 2016). The study of microbiomes in the plant phyllosphere during rust infection is barely explored (Busby et al. 2016).

In this study, we conducted a dual RNA-seq analysis of apple leaves inoculated with the rust fungus *G. yamadae* at two timepoints, 10 days postinoculation (dpi) and 30 dpi, compared with a mock-inoculated treatment. We aimed to explore the host responses to *G. yamadae* infection and to identify rust genes expressed during the interaction with apple leaves, with an emphasis on secreted proteins (SPs) that may relate to pathogenicity. We also report on the possible impact *G. yamadae* infection may have on fungal communities of the apple phyllosphere.

RESULTS

Experimental design and RNA-seq results.

Apple rust spermatogonia and aecia and corresponding mock-inoculated treatments were collected from leaves of two-year-old apple seedlings inoculated with *G. yamadae* basidiospores or water at 10 and 30 dpi (Fig. 1; Supplementary Fig. S1). Total

Fig. 1. Spermatogonia and aecia stages in the *Gymnosporangium yamadae* life cycle. **A**, schematic view of *G. yamadae* life cycle illustrating the spore stages used for inoculation (here teliospores and basidiospores from *Juniperus chinensis* as primary inoculum) and for samples collection (spermatogonia and aecia on *Malus domestica*). **B**, Spermatogonia visible on the upper surface of apple leaves 10 days after controlled inoculation. **C**, Upper (left) and lower (right) sides of the same apple leaf with colored area around the sporulation zones and tubular aecia extruding on the lower side of the leaf 30 days after inoculation. **D**, longitudinal section of a *G. yamadae* infected apple leaf stained with aniline blue and phenol red, showing a tubular aecium in red formed on the lower leaf epidermis, directly below a globoid spermatogonium also in red, shown on the upper epidermis.

RNA for each replicate was isolated, was sequenced using the Illumina HiSeq platform, and was subjected to a dedicated analysis pipeline (Supplementary Fig. S2). After removing reads of low quality, 264 and 269 million paired clean reads were obtained for infected apples leaves and 194 and 151 million clean reads from healthy leaves at 10 and 30 dpi, respectively (Table 1). Paired-end reads were aligned to the *M. domestica* reference genome (Velasco et al. 2010), using Tophat v.2.0.12 (Trapnell et al. 2009), and the mapped rates are relatively lower in infected leaves than in healthy leaves and even lower at 30 dpi (24.68% for average), which reflects the development of the rust pathogen inside the infected leaves (Table 1). Pearson correlation coefficients (r^2) were calculated between biological replicates and conditions to assess the overall reproducibility of the data (Fig. 2A). The results showed a strong correlation between replicates of a single condition, and a clear separation between independent conditions (Fig. 2A). The principal component analyses (PCA) based on read counts confirmed the distinction of expression profiles of inoculated and mock-inoculated samples at the two timepoints and the proximity of biological replicates (Fig. 2B).

After mapping the Illumina reads onto the 57,386 predicted genes in the apple genome (Velasco et al. 2010), 26,530 and 29,227 transcripts were identified from inoculated and mock-inoculated conditions at 10 dpi, respectively. In addition, 29,725 and 26,867 transcripts were found in inoculated and mock-inoculated conditions at 30 dpi, respectively (Supplementary Table S1). Reads unmapped to the apple genome in each inoculated condition were pooled and assembled using de novo assembly Trinity (Grabherr et al. 2011) and fragments per kilobase of transcript sequence per millions base pairs sequenced (FPKM) values were calculated for all assembled unigenes. In order to identify apple rust transcripts in the absence of a reference genome for *G. yamadae*, these tentative fungal unigenes were compared with reference basidiomycete genomes, including four rust species and 97,034 Pucciniales expressed sequence tags (ESTs). In total, 30,293 and 22,717

G. yamadae-expressed unigenes were detected in infected apple leaves at the spermatogonial and aecial stage, respectively (Supplementary Fig. S2; Supplementary Table S2). After assignment of transcripts to the plant host and unigenes to the rust fungus, we considered unassigned reads and compared them to the National Center for Biotechnology Information (NCBI) database, revealing the presence of other fungal sequences belonging to phylum Ascomycota (19.3 and 27.7% in spermatogonia and aecia unigenes, respectively). This observation prompted us to explore the fungal community composition in the apple phyllosphere in more detail.

Apple leaf transcriptional changes upon *G. yamadae* infection.

The four transcriptomes obtained in this study were compared together to determine gene-expression profiles in apple leaves during infection by *G. yamadae* at the spermatogonial and aecial stages. A total of 34,246 transcripts (59.7% of *M. domestica* genes) were expressed in at least one condition, and 22,167 (38.6%) transcripts were expressed in all conditions. We found 300 (0.9%) transcripts exclusive of the inoculated conditions and 256 (0.7%) of the mock-inoculated conditions, whereas a total of 1,115 (3.3%) genes were only expressed at 10 dpi and 1,283 (3.7%) at 30 dpi (Fig. 3). To explore the molecular mechanisms triggered in response to *G. yamadae* infection, pairwise comparisons of the host plant transcriptomes were conducted between inoculated and mock-inoculated apple leaves at the two timepoints, and transcripts showing significant levels of expression regulation ($p_{adj} \leq 0.05$) were regarded as differentially expressed genes (DEGs). The comparisons between inoculated and mock-inoculated apple leaves generated 13,961 DEGs at 10 dpi (7,784 upregulated and 6,177 downregulated) and 4,428 at 30 dpi (2,883 upregulated and 1,545 downregulated) (Fig. 4; Supplementary Table S1). Hierarchical clustering of DEGs showed dynamic expression profiles at the two infection stages in this compatible apple-rust interaction (Fig. 4). Among these DEGs, 579 and 291, respectively, were up-regulated and down-regulated in response to the infection of *G. yamadae*, representing *G. yamadae* infection-related DEGs (Fig. 4). Among highly induced apple transcripts in infected leaves at 10 dpi, 56 unigenes encoding glutathione S-transferase (GST) showed a fold change up to 194, among which 23 had a fold change over 10, whereas only 14 GSTs were up-regulated at 30 dpi with a fold change ranging from 3 to 27 (Supplementary Table S1). In total, 12 GST transcripts were induced both at 10 and 30 dpi. Interestingly, eight mannitol dehydrogenase-encoding genes were also among highly induced transcripts at 10 dpi (fold change to 231), while no significant change was observed at 30 dpi. Several gene functions related to cell wall, phytohormones, or response to pathogens were found among the top highly expressed DEGs at 10 and 30 dpi (Table 2).

Impact of rust infection on metabolic pathways in apple leaves.

In order to determine the impact of the rust infection on metabolic pathways of apple leaves, we performed classification of DEGs into cellular categories, using MapMan and KEGG (Kyoto Encyclopedia of Genes and Genomes), and performed enrichment analysis. All DEGs were integrated into MapMan plant categories and 52 and 56% of them were classified into 28 functional categories at 10 and 30 dpi, respectively (Fig. 5A; Supplementary Table S1). The direct comparison of proportions of up- and downregulated transcripts assigned to Mapman categories helped to draw major variations in metabolic pathways. For instance, photosynthesis processes were remarkably represented among the downregulated transcripts at

Table 1. Sequencing and mapping information of RNA-seq data from 12 libraries of apple leaves

Library	Clean reads	Reads mapped to <i>Malus domestica</i>	Rust unigenes ^a
Inoculated (10 dpi)_1	100,206,930	61,059,189 (60.9%)	30,293
Inoculated (10 dpi)_2	77,191,936	49,422,953 (64.0%)	
Inoculated (10 dpi)_3	87,378,970	56,459,826 (64.6%)	
Total	264,777,836	166,941,968 (63.2%)	
Mock-inoculated (10 dpi)_1	65,394,614	51,116,139 (78.2%)	–
Mock-inoculated (10 dpi)_2	66,237,512	51,749,324 (78.1%)	
Mock-inoculated (10 dpi)_3	62,536,254	49,104,270 (78.5%)	
Total	194,186,380	151,969,733 (78.3%)	
Inoculated (30 dpi)_1	87,373,062	22,244,421 (25.5%)	22,717
Inoculated (30 dpi)_2	97,680,330	19,448,833 (19.9%)	
Inoculated (30 dpi)_3	84,796,366	24,319,732 (28.7%)	
Total	269,849,758	66,012,986 (24.7%)	
Mock-inoculated (30 dpi)_1	41,186,566	33,721,232 (81.9%)	–
Mock-inoculated (30 dpi)_2	51,906,804	42,616,916 (82.1%)	
Mock-inoculated (30 dpi)_3	58,183,906	47,693,953 (81.9%)	
Total	151,277,276	124,032,101 (82.0%)	

^a Unmapped reads from inoculated apple leaves at 10 and 30 days postinoculation (dpi) were assembled and compared with Basidiomycota genomic data and Pucciniales expressed sequence tags to determine rust unigenes for spermatogonia and aecia, respectively.

the two timepoints. Conversely, cellular respiration was more represented among induced transcripts at both timepoints in infected apple leaves (Fig. 5A; Supplementary Table S1). Interestingly, the solute transport category was proportionally more abundant in both up- and downregulated transcripts at 10 dpi, indicating that this process might be particularly

dynamic at the spermogonia infection stage. Similarly, the RNA trafficking category was also more represented in up- and downregulated transcripts at 30 dpi, suggesting a highly dynamic regulation of this process at the aecial stage. The phytohormones and cell-wall categories were also more represented among transcripts upregulated at 10 dpi, and the

Fig. 2. Assessment of RNA-seq data reproducibility. **A**, Hierarchical clustering of replicates of the inoculated and mock-inoculated conditions at the two timepoints 10 and 30 days postinoculation (dpi), based on Pearson correlation coefficients between samples. **B**, Principal component analysis of read counts of inoculated and mock-inoculated conditions at the timepoints 10 and 30 dpi, showing the clear separation of the four tested conditions and the proximity of biological replicates. The two principal components explain 81% of the total variance.

vesicle trafficking category was more prominent at 30 dpi among upregulated transcripts (Fig. 5A). Almost all the genes falling in the MapMan photosynthesis-related apparatus category (photosystem I, photosystem II, ATP synthase, redox chain, photorespiration and Calvin cycle) were significantly down-regulated in infected leaves at the two timepoints (Fig. 5B).

All DEGs were also classified into KEGG pathways and an enrichment analysis between inoculated and mock-inoculated groups was performed for down- and upregulated transcripts. In total, 3,090 and 715 downregulated transcripts were classified into 124 and 85 KEGG pathways, at 10 and 30 dpi respectively, whereas 4,133 and 1,493 upregulated transcripts were classified in 122 and 112 KEGG pathways at 10 and 30 dpi, respectively (Supplementary Table S1). Consistent with the MapMan annotation results, photosynthesis-related pathways were among the most significant downregulated pathways at both timepoints, including biosynthesis of light-harvesting chlorophyll protein complex in antenna proteins, impaired processes of photosystem I, photosystem II, and cytochrome b6/f complex (Supplementary Table S1). Glutathione metabolism, endocytosis, and amino sugar and nucleotide sugar metabolism (ANM) categories were significantly enriched among upregulated transcripts at 10 dpi (Fig. 6). At 30 dpi, the three most significantly enriched pathways were i) flavonoid biosynthesis, ii) stilbenoid, diarylheptanoid, and gingerol biosynthesis, and iii) phenylpropanoid biosynthesis (Fig. 6). Interestingly, many other pathways directly related to plant secondary metabolism, such as phenylalanine metabolism or biosynthesis of secondary metabolites, were found among significantly enriched KEGG categories at this timepoint. Categories related to aromatic and volatile compounds or to tyrosine metabolism and tyrosine-derived alkaloids were also significantly enriched at 30 dpi. Altogether, these results suggest that the leaf may undergo alteration in its composition, as exemplified by the large discolored spots around infection sites visible in Figure 1. Interestingly, the plant-pathogen interaction pathway was significantly induced during infection at 10 dpi but was repressed at 30 dpi (Fig. 6; Supplementary Table S1). Overall, the survey of functional categories expressed in apple leaves in response to

G. yamadae infection indicates that, even if a compatible interaction is established by the rust fungus during its biotrophic growth, a remarkable reaction is noticeable in the leaf tissues on the host side, particularly with the expression of functions related to secondary metabolism and plant-pathogen reactions, as early as 10 dpi and more markedly by 30 dpi in inoculated compared with mock-inoculated conditions.

G. yamadae spermogonia and aecia expressed genes.

The average length of the unigenes assigned to the rust fungus in spermogonia and aecia are, respectively, 1,622 and 1,956 bp, and the largest proportion of unigenes, with 19,589 (64.67%) and 16,867 (74.25%) at 10 and 30 dpi, respectively, is larger than 1 kb, indicating the good quality of the read assembly into fungal unigenes (Supplementary Fig. S3). Comparison of the fungal unigenes to the NCBI non-redundant (nr), Swissprot, and Eukaryotic Orthologous Group (KOG) databases provided putative annotation support for 17,951 (59.3%) spermogonia unigenes and 17,515 (77.1%) aecia unigenes. Among them, 7,647 and 9,059 unigenes showed homology to genes of the wheat leaf rust fungus *Puccinia graminis* f. sp. *tritici* and 2,072 and 2,557 unigenes showed homology to genes of the poplar rust fungus *Melampsora larici-populina*. Among the 26 and 23 most highly expressed unigenes (FPKM value > 1,000) in spermogonia and aecia, respectively, more than half are hypothetical proteins or without any hit in the nr database (Table 3). Beyond that, we identified unigenes encoding SPs, polyubiquitin-A, and a pheromone precursor highly expressed in spermogonia, and unigenes encoding SPs and a thiazole biosynthetic enzyme highly expressed in aecia (Table 3). As in other rust fungi, many highly expressed rust unigenes are of unknown function. These molecular determinants are conserved across rust species and may play an important role in pathogenesis-related processes.

Prediction of in planta SPs expressed by *G. yamadae* during apple leaf infection.

Rust fungi possess very large repertoires of SPs that contain effectors, which have significant roles in the establishment

Fig. 3. Venn diagram showing the number of apple leaf genes expressed in each condition. Group I indicates the genes detected in all conditions; group II refers to genes specifically found in the mock-inoculated groups at the two 10 and 30 days postinoculation (dpi) timepoints; group III refers to genes exclusively expressed in the inoculated groups at the two timepoints.

of compatible interactions with their host plants (Lorrain et al. 2019). We predicted 38,039 and 29,160 proteins from *G. yamadae* spermogonia and aecia unigenes, respectively. Based on a dedicated bioinformatic pipeline, we identified 978 (2.6%) and 1,091 (3.7%) SPs (Supplementary Table S2). In detail, the 978 spermogonia SPs contain 219 carbohydrate-active enzymes (CAZymes), 75 proteases, and 11 lipases, and five of these SPs were highly expressed at this stage (FPKM value > 1,000), including the unigene exhibiting the highest expression level (Cluster 3395.52629) (Supplementary Table S2). Among the 1,091 SPs predicted in aecia, 246, 57, and 10 proteins were classified into CAZymes, proteases, and lipases, respectively. Four SP unigenes showed high expression levels at the aecial stage (FPKM > 1,000) (Supplementary Table S2). Predicted proteins from spermogonia and aecia were compared with proteins previously identified in *G. yamadae* telia (Tao et al. 2017), with a Markov cluster algorithm (MCL) analysis, in order to identify proteins specific to apple infection stages (Supplementary Table S2). In total, 1,097 MCL protein families, with a total of 3,584 proteins, only contained proteins from spermogonia and aecia (1,831 and 1,753, respectively) and are considered specific to apple infection. Besides, 2,202 MCL protein

families with a total of 2,704 proteins (7.1% of 38,039 predicted proteins in spermogonia) were identified as specific to the spermogonia stage. Among these proteins, 45 were predicted as SPs. Furthermore, 1,322 protein families with a total of 1,801 proteins (6.2% of 29,160 predicted proteins in aecia) were specific to the aecia stage, including 50 SPs (Supplementary Table S2). Among spermogonia and aecia predicted SPs, six showed homology to rust transferred protein 1 (RTP1), initially described in *Uromyces* spp. (Kemen et al. 2005) and since shown as conserved across all rust fungi (Lorrain et al. 2019; Pretsch et al. 2013). The six amino-acid sequences ranged between 170 to 260 residues, and a sequence alignment with 13 RTP homologs from seven different rust fungi showed relatively conserved regions in the C-terminal second half of the protein, with conserved cysteine positions along the sequence (Supplementary Fig. S4). Interestingly, *Gymnosporangium* spp. RTP homologs clustered in two different groups, one specific to the genus with *Gymnosporangium sabinae* and another with *Hemileia vastatrix*, the coffee rust fungus, distinct from RTPs from families Pucciniaceae (*Uromyces* spp.) and Melampsoraceae (Supplementary Fig. S4). This result indicates the presence of an ancestral and conserved rust SP

Fig. 4. Differentially expressed genes (DEGs) between inoculated and mock-inoculated apple leaves at 10 and 30 days postinoculation (dpi). **A**, Hierarchical clustering analysis of the DEGs at 10 and 30 dpi. **B**, Venn diagrams show all the upregulated and downregulated genes at 10 and 30 dpi, with arrows pointing to the number of genes differentially expressed at both timepoints.

multigene family for RTP in *Gymnosporangium* spp. and the expression of distinct sets of SPs—i.e., likely candidate apple rust effectors—at specific infection stages.

Functional distribution of *G. yamadae* unigenes during the interaction with two host plants, apple and juniper.

G. yamadae unigenes from spermogonia and aecia were annotated in the KOG database. In total, 16,458 (54.33%) and 11,299 (49.74%) unigenes showed homology in the KOG database (Supplementary Table S2), and the functional categories were compared with the distribution previously reported for the telial stage on juniper tree (Tao et al. 2017). Excluding the category of “unknown function” and “general function prediction only”, the most abundant KOG categories corresponded to “posttranslational modification, protein turnover, chaperones” at all three stages. The KOG categories showed similar distribution across the different fungal stages, although, in each

KOG category, the unigenes are more abundant in spermogonia and aecia. A “secreted proteins” category corresponding to SP of unknown function was included in the KOG annotation, and the unigenes falling into this category were more abundant in telia and aecia than in spermogonia (Supplementary Fig. S5). Although we do not have a reference genome for *G. yamadae* and, as such, we cannot accurately estimate the extent of each transcriptome completeness, this comparison suggests that similar genetic programs are expressed on the different host plants at distinct sporulation stages, with the concomitant expression of specific subsets of genes in distinct categories to achieve one or both specific host infection or fungal sporulation-related processes.

Infection of *G. yamadae* may affect the composition of fungal communities in the apple phyllosphere.

Unexpectedly, beyond the apple and rust transcripts, we noticed a large number of unigenes showing homology with

Table 2. Top significantly differentially expressed apple genes (DEGs) in leaves infected by the rust fungus *Gymnosporangium yamadae* at 10 and 30 days postinoculation (dpi)^a

Gene_ID	Read count		Log ₂ (fold change)	P value	Gene description
	Inoculated	Mock-inoculated			
10 dpi					
103443849	6,675.97	21.44	8.29	3.70E-148	Short-chain type dehydrogenase/reductase-like
103415907	1,303.09	3.42	8.58	3.53E-108	Reticuline oxidase-like protein
103400169	692.51	2.81	7.95	7.39E-54	Patatin-like protein
103439643	660.84	1.4	8.89	2.38E-03	No hit found
103413950	618.35	0	>9.28	3.39E-10	Beta-glucosidase
103408464	582.8	0.85	9.44	4.21E-15	Flavanone 7- <i>O</i> -glucoside 2''- <i>O</i> -beta-L-rhamnosyltransferase-like
103426327	452.31	0.85	9.07	4.27E-74	1-Aminocyclopropane-1-carboxylate synthase-like
103440114	349.25	0.87	8.66	1.54E-63	Sorbitol dehydrogenase-like
103429696	334.68	0.57	9.21	7.93E-12	Putative 12-oxophytodienoate reductase
103423646	318.52	0.29	10.15	2.25E-09	Beta-glucosidase
103404862	280.77	1.14	7.96	4.40E-16	Formin-like protein
103436320	251.41	0	>7.98	3.73E-03	Beta-glucosidase
103421201	245.17	0.86	8.16	8.61E-51	Patatin-like protein
103425667	220.69	0.57	8.62	6.93E-28	Uncharacterized locus
103447903	211.32	0.86	7.96	5.16E-30	Bifunctional monodehydroascorbate reductase and carbonic anhydrase nectarin-like
103420873	194.51	0.59	8.39	1.07E-17	Probable LRR receptor-like serine/threonine-protein kinase
103423647	189.96	0	>7.57	1.09E-02	Cyanogenic beta-glucosidase-like
103401439	141.45	0.29	8.98	2.50E-07	Uncharacterized locus
103413952	116.62	0	>6.87	1.85E-07	Uncharacterized locus
103404861	110.04	0.28	8.64	4.08E-30	Vegetative cell wall protein gp1-like
103449066	2.29	112.76	-5.63	5.85E-03	Transcription initiation factor TFIID subunit
103440578	2.46	117.2	-5.58	5.21E-03	Aspartic protease in guard cell-like protein
103403477	2.78	144.21	-5.7	4.65E-10	Serine/threonine-protein kinase BRI1-like
103440896	0.39	235.97	-9.26	2.41E-11	Thermospermine synthase acaulis-like
103455791	2.91	292	-6.66	2.02E-06	Thermospermine synthase acaulis-like
103437991	2.51	327.42	-7.03	7.56E-12	Zinc finger protein Constans-like
103451980	5.91	422.22	-6.17	3.42E-05	Galactinol synthase-like
103451601	1.4	634.37	-8.84	1.92E-07	Beta-amyrin 28-oxidase-like
103424346	22.24	2,625.42	-6.89	1.77E-04	Uncharacterized locus
30 dpi					
103451807	4,251.52	0.34	13.64	1.72E-41	Expansin-A10
103452933	2,805.97	1.36	11.02	1.16E-35	SRG1-like protein
103433546	2,182.84	5.02	8.77	7.86E-06	Laccase-like
103425476	2,098.2	0.54	11.94	8.04E-36	Expansin-A1-like
103433527	1,359.8	0.95	10.49	4.09E-32	Nonspecific lipid-transfer protein
103438035	1,276.53	0.28	12.17	3.03E-33	Expansin-A8-like
103411433	1,080.33	0	>10.08	8.71E-20	Uncharacterized locus
103456171	970.52	1.32	9.53	1.05E-05	Uncharacterized locus
103441305	904.03	0	>9.83	8.59E-14	Carotenoid cleavage dioxygenase 8 homolog B chloroplastic
103443282	835.31	1.71	8.94	5.04E-27	36.4 kDa proline-rich protein-like
103441585	702.17	1.4	8.98	2.32E-26	Extensin
103443566	686.29	0.8	9.75	1.78E-27	Anthranilate <i>N</i> -benzoyltransferase protein
103404862	681.53	0.56	10.27	3.60E-28	Formin-like protein
103452268	531.22	0	>9.06	5.88E-20	Early nodulin-93-like
103402951	517.95	0.8	9.35	1.21E-25	Transcription factor bHLH79-like

(Continued on next page)

^a Only DEGs showing a read count over 100 in one of the conditions (inoculated or mock-inoculated) were considered at each timepoint.

other fungi, particularly ascomycetes. Since these sequences were also present in controlled apple leaves, they most likely correspond to resident fungal communities on or inside the leaves of the two-year-old apple seedlings used in our experimental setup. We used a dedicated metatranscriptomic approach to detail the fungal communities present in inoculated and in mock-inoculated apple leaves at 10 and 30 dpi (Supplementary Fig. S2). The clean reads from the 12 Illumina libraries that did not map onto the *M. domestica* genome were assembled into 64,637 unigenes. Then the clean reads from each sample were assigned to these unigenes and were annotated by comparison with all fungal genomes available in the MycoCosm database at the Joint Genome Institute (JGI), to know the detailed fungal composition in each sample. The unigenes that did not match to MycoCosm were compared with the nr database at NCBI to determine their taxonomical origin. Supplementary Table S3 details the number of total and fungal unigenes found in each sample replicate. As expected, the fungal unigenes are predominant in inoculated conditions and,

proportionally, the fungal reads are more important at the aecial stage at 30 dpi (Supplementary Fig. S6). Unigenes of metazoan origin were limited in all samples and unigenes assigned to clade Viridiplantae still constituted the largest proportion in the control conditions and a small portion of the inoculated conditions. These sequences of plant origin that did not map to the apple genome may represent specific or divergent sequences from the Chinese genotype used in the study compared with the reference apple genome (Supplementary Fig. S6). As expected, the major part of the fungal communities in infected apple leaves are members of order Pucciniales, with homology to *Puccinia* spp., *Melampsora* spp., and *Cronartium* spp. (Fig. 7A). The level of identity of *G. yamadae* transcripts with the matching sequences in these rust fungal species is close to 60% on average, which indicates that they are not due to surface contamination by spores from other rust species (Supplementary Fig. S7). The detection of a limited number of rust transcripts in control leaves at 30 dpi (Fig. 7A) may correspond to air contamination by *G. yamadae* from juniper trees present in

Table 2. (Continued from previous page)

Gene_ID	Read count		Log ₂ (fold change)	P value	Gene description
	Inoculated	Mock-inoculated			
103455522	505.15	0.62	9.69	5.15E-26	Anthocyanidin 3-O-glucosyltransferase-like
103419762	505.14	0	>8.99	3.64E-28	Uncharacterized locus
103400077	477.78	0	>8.91	4.05E-09	36.4 kDa proline-rich protein-like
103417079	476.51	0.88	9.1	6.98E-08	Collectin-like
103438562	425.63	0	>8.74	4.15E-27	NRT1/PTR family protein
103421504	388.31	0.56	9.46	2.77E-13	Uncharacterized locus
103404890	286.73	0	>8.17	4.62E-24	LOB domain-containing protein
103402332	286.66	0	>8.17	3.70E-10	Basic blue protein-like
103446347	283.53	0.26	10.1	7.64E-23	Uncharacterized locus
103429659	280.15	0	>8.14	1.05E-07	SRG1-like protein
103448995	275.5	0	>8.11	4.08E-10	Ent-copalyl diphosphate synthase, chloroplastic
103408191	269.95	0	>8.08	8.44E-24	Acyl-[acyl-carrier-protein] desaturase, chloroplastic-like
103455514	241.42	0.26	9.86	1.27E-06	Nonspecific lipid-transfer protein 2-like
103402593	235.55	0.28	9.73	1.95E-07	No hit found
103400926	232.04	0.28	9.71	3.78E-14	Dehydration-responsive protein RD22-like
103418672	211.69	0	>7.73	1.14E-18	DNA-damage-repair/tolerance protein DRT100-like
103404861	194.73	0	>7.61	1.86E-21	Vegetative cell wall protein gp1-like
103443280	187.64	0	>7.56	3.44E-21	Early nodulin-like
103453404	178.6	0	>7.49	1.83E-04	Protease inhibitor-like
103400792	172.57	0	>7.44	8.40E-20	1-Aminocyclopropane-1-carboxylate oxidase 1
103423101	170.34	0	>7.42	5.54E-06	Sulfate transporter 3.1-like
103441202	166.87	0	>7.39	2.42E-20	Expansin-B3-like
103450960	163.92	0	>7.36	3.52E-20	Transcription factor bHLH94-like
103438017	161.77	0	>7.34	4.26E-20	Expansin-A8-like
103415187	151.87	0	>7.25	1.14E-19	Pectate lyase
103436684	148.38	0	>7.22	1.20E-19	Putative DNA-binding protein ESCAROLA
103415461	139.08	0	>7.12	5.42E-10	Carotenoid cleavage dioxygenase 8 homolog B, chloroplastic-like
103402577	124.98	0	>6.97	1.67E-14	MLP-like protein 329
103413366	118.38	0.28	8.74	6.80E-17	Time for coffee-like protein
103432922	117.63	0	>6.88	5.53E-18	Expansin-A8
103453609	108.21	0	>6.76	2.72E-17	AP2-like ethylene-responsive transcription factor BBM
103453438	0	114.9	< -6.76	8.73E-06	Ethylene-responsive transcription factor ERF109-like
103426648	0.36	122.03	-8.44	1.01E-05	Ethylene-responsive transcription factor TINY-like
103413400	1.25	141.53	-6.84	8.69E-06	Indole-3-acetic acid-induced protein ARG2-like
103451896	0.71	190.98	-8.09	2.02E-05	Glycerol-3-phosphate 2-O-acyltransferase-like
103433370	2.3	207.08	-6.5	8.38E-04	Zinc finger protein ZAT11-like
103434640	3.96	299.22	-6.25	1.53E-05	(3S,6E)-Nerolidol synthase 1-like
103425818	6.71	482.06	-6.17	1.66E-17	Carbonic anhydrase, chloroplastic-like
103443332	7.25	502.77	-6.12	8.04E-04	23 kDa jasmonate-induced protein-like
103421612	2.46	659.1	-8.07	3.28E-23	Carbonic anhydrase, chloroplastic-like
103435858	11.57	981.63	-6.41	2.38E-03	Uncharacterized locus
103453940	2.75	1,183.48	-8.76	3.23E-03	Dehydration-responsive element-binding protein-like
103421479	5.02	2,682.39	-9.07	6.29E-30	Carbonic anhydrase-like
103453624	29.41	3,036	-6.69	3.72E-05	Methanol O-anthraniloyltransferase-like
103407412	12.06	4,074.08	-8.41	7.74E-04	Cytosolic sulfotransferase-like
103400423	26.2	5,974.65	-7.84	3.85E-05	Dehydrolipichyl diphosphate synthase-like
103439257	40.36	6,793.83	-7.4	5.14E-05	Uncharacterized locus
103440452	333.71	27,405.51	-6.36	6.20E-04	Uncharacterized locus

the surroundings of the outdoor location, however, no rust symptoms were visible on control plants at 30 dpi. The average relative abundance of rust fungi is 56.5% at 10 dpi and it increases to 76.5% at 30 dpi, reflecting the increase of *G. yamadae* biomass at 30 dpi (Supplementary Table S3). The distribution of reads into other fungal taxonomical groups is relatively similar at all stages, with the exception of the inoculated stage at 30 dpi. This different distribution is better illustrated after the removal of the reads assigned to rust fungi (Fig. 7B). Unigenes with homology to *Macroventuria* spp., *Alternaria* spp., *Didymella* spp., *Ascochyta* spp., and *Boeremia* spp. from the Pleosporales order and *Lizonia* spp. were the most abundant in the mock-inoculated conditions at 10 and 30 dpi as well as in the inoculated condition at 10 dpi. Strikingly, in the inoculated condition at 30 dpi, there is a complete shift in the fungal community composition. This aecial infection stage is marked by a large dominance of *Alternaria* spp. and

Fonsecaea spp., whereas the other abundant ascomycetes from order Pleosporales found in the control conditions and in the inoculated condition at 10 dpi are almost absent (Fig. 7B). Interestingly, a series of less-represented fungal species are present in all samples and are less influenced by *G. yamadae* infection (Fig. 7B; Supplementary Table S3). This result shows that the progression of rust disease in inoculated apple leaves may have an impact on the phyllosphere fungal community.

DISCUSSION

The leaf rust disease caused by the biotrophic fungus *G. yamadae* can generate substantial injuries to apple trees and result in lower fruit quality (Wang et al. 2010) and, so far, there is scarce information about the molecular processes underlying the apple–fungal rust interaction (Lu et al. 2017). RNA-seq has

Fig. 5. Overview of the transcriptional changes of *Gymnosporangium yamadae*-inoculated apple leaves. **A**, All the differentially expressed genes at 10 and 30 days postinoculation (dpi) were classified into MapMan metabolic pathways. The chart shows the percentage of up- or downregulated genes at 10 and 30 dpi classified into each pathway. **B**, Genes involved in photosynthesis are significantly downregulated in inoculated groups compared with mock-inoculated groups at 10 and 30 dpi. The photosynthetic apparatus-related genes were defined according to MapMan bin code and the expression profiles were visualized by the MapMan tool.

facilitated simultaneous detection of gene expression for host plants and pathogens in various pathosystems, providing new insights into understanding disease processes (Westermann et al. 2017). Availability of the apple reference genome makes it possible to monitor the transcripts expressed in infected apple leaves (Velasco et al. 2010). In the present study, we used a dual RNA-seq approach to monitor the transcriptome of apple leaves during disease progression in a compatible interaction with the rust fungus *G. yamadae* and to identify fungal genes related to pathogenesis.

Rust fungi are obligate biotrophs that establish compatible interactions to derive nutrients from their hosts (Kemen et al. 2015; Lorrain et al. 2019). In this relationship, the plant is maintained alive and the rust fungus proliferates, forming specific infection structures called haustoria and, later on,

spores that ensure propagation in the life cycle. The haustoria are formed at early stages, from which the fungus releases effector proteins to interfere with the host physiology (Petre et al. 2014). From the same structures, nutrients are channeled to the fungus through specific transport systems (Struck 2015; Voegelé et al. 2009). During the whole infection process, host immunity is ineffective against the invading rust fungus, contrary to incompatible plant-rust fungus interactions that are marked by strong and early defense reactions through the specific detection of pathogen molecular determinants (Duplessis et al. 2009; Rinaldi et al. 2007). However, at late stages of compatible interactions, infected leaf tissues can present physiological reactions to rust infection during sporulation (Duplessis et al. 2009; Miranda et al. 2007; Ullah et al. 2017).

Fig. 6. The Kyoto Encyclopedia of Genes and Genomes (KEGG) pathway enrichment analysis of all upregulated genes in inoculated apple leaves based on the hypergeometric test. **A** and **B**, The most enriched pathways in inoculated apple leaves at 10 and 30 days postinoculation (dpi), respectively. Gene number refers to the genes annotated in each pathway and corrected *p*-value is the *P* value after Benjamini and Hochberg correction. The pathways with corrected *P* value < 0.05 were considered as significantly enriched.

The compatible interaction established by *G. yamadae* with apple leaves induces marked reactions including alteration of secondary metabolism pathways.

Glutathione is a tripeptide in plants, playing important roles in defense reactions to pathogens, including detoxification of reactive oxygen species, regulation of formation of phytoalexin, and degradation of various toxic substances through the catalyzing by GSTs (Gullner et al. 2018). In the present study, the glutathione pathway was highly enriched in inoculated apple leaves at 10 dpi, according to the KEGG pathway enrichment analysis, and, consistent with that, a large number of GST-encoding genes were highly induced at early infection times. Similar observations were made during infection of

poplar leaves by the rust fungus *M. larici-populina* in the frame of an incompatible interaction at early timepoints (2 days postinoculation) (Rinaldi et al. 2007). Regulation of GST gene expression was also observed at later timepoints in compatible poplar-poplar rust interactions (Azaiez et al. 2009; Miranda et al. 2007). GSTs form a widespread and ubiquitous superfamily of plant genes, with specific expansions in trees (Lallement et al. 2014; Pégeot et al. 2014). These enzymes have various and specific roles, some being associated to the response to rust infection (Duplessis et al. 2009; Pégeot et al. 2014). The high expression of GST genes in apple leaves may be required for detoxication of compounds accumulated during early rust infection. Beyond glutathione, the ANM

Table 3. Most highly expressed *Gymnosporangium yamadae* unigenes (FPKM > 10³) in infected apple leaves at 10 days postinoculation (spermogonia) and 30 days postinoculation (aecia)^a

Gene_id	Gene length	FPKM	SP	Nr description	Best blast hit (species) ^b	Accession no.
Spermogonia						
Cluster-3395.52629	950	2,0408.36	Yes	Hypothetical protein	<i>Schizophyllum commune</i> H4-8	SCHCODRAFT_17653
Cluster-3395.52347	543	1,3219.69	No	–	–	–
Cluster-3395.53063	1,628	6,900.57	No	Pheromone precursor	<i>Melampsora larici-populina</i> 98AG31	MELLADRAFT_124593
Cluster-3395.53628	768	5,172.74	No	Glutathione transferase omega-1	<i>Pyrenophora tritici-repentis</i> Pt-1C-BFP	PTRG_06303
Cluster-3395.53292	667	4,195.46	No	Thioredoxin	<i>Lichtheimia corymbifera</i> JMRC:FSU:9682	LCOR_10494.1
Cluster-3395.52692	1,320	3,962.04	No	Hypothetical protein	<i>Melampsora larici-populina</i> 98AG31	MELLADRAFT_90288
Cluster-3395.52264	2,139	3,931.11	Yes	Hypothetical protein	<i>Puccinia graminis</i> f. sp. <i>tritici</i> CRL 75-36-700-3	PGTG_16232
Cluster-3395.53264	493	3,145.31	No	–	–	–
Cluster-3395.53104	1,367	3,014.95	No	–	–	–
Cluster-3395.52880	2,175	2,403.82	No	Hypothetical protein	<i>Rhizophagus irregularis</i> DAOM 181602	GLOINDRAFT_336076
Cluster-3395.50468	346	2,387.85	No	Polyubiquitin-A	<i>Puccinia graminis</i> f. sp. <i>tritici</i> CRL 75-36-700-3	PGTG_13068
Cluster-3395.53066	1,876	1,962.48	No	Carbohydrate-binding module family 20 protein	<i>Baudoinia compniacensis</i> UAMH 10762	BAUCODRAFT_75770
Cluster-3395.52404	929	1,898.96	No	Glutathione peroxidase	<i>Candida tenuis</i> ATCC 10573	CANTEDRAFT_99227
Cluster-3395.51614	987	1,867.29	No	Hypothetical protein	<i>Rhizophagus irregularis</i> DAOM 181602	GLOINDRAFT_254986
Cluster-3395.50509	1,007	1,860.47	Yes	Hypothetical protein	<i>Puccinia graminis</i> f. sp. <i>tritici</i> CRL 75-36-700-3	PGTG_19614
Cluster-3395.54678	289	1,740.58	No	Polyubiquitin-A	<i>Puccinia graminis</i> f. sp. <i>tritici</i> CRL 75-36-700-3	PGTG_13068
Cluster-3395.54279	620	1,438.94	No	Hypothetical protein	<i>Setosphaeria turcica</i> Et28A	SETTUDRAFT_172987
Cluster-3395.52185	1,115	1,277.40	Yes	Secreted protein	<i>Melampsora larici-populina</i> 98AG31	MELLADRAFT_77195
Cluster-3395.47475	277	1,127.98	No	Polyubiquitin-A	<i>Puccinia graminis</i> f. sp. <i>tritici</i> CRL 75-36-700-3	PGTG_13068
Cluster-3395.52238	2,102	1,115.53	No	Hypothetical protein	<i>Parasitella parasitica</i>	PARPA_04782.1
Cluster-3395.47751	800	1,069.38	No	Calmodulin	<i>Batrachochytrium dendrobatidis</i> JAM81	BATDEDRAFT_19649
Cluster-3395.54738	2,488	1,068.63	Yes	Hypothetical protein	<i>Rhizophagus irregularis</i> DAOM 181602	GLOINDRAFT_64662
Cluster-3395.52566	2,594	1,066.09	No	Hypothetical protein	<i>Puccinia graminis</i> f. sp. <i>tritici</i> CRL 75-36-700-3	PGTG_05495
Cluster-3395.52492	2,983	1,052.32	No	Hypothetical protein	<i>Puccinia graminis</i> f. sp. <i>tritici</i> CRL 75-36-700-3	PGTG_01215
Cluster-3395.52660	1,225	1,004.77	No	NADP-dependent leukotriene B4 12-hydroxydehydrogenase	<i>Schizosaccharomyces japonicus</i> yFS275	SJAG_02151
Cluster-3395.54718	1,202	1,004.76	No	–	–	–

(Continued on next page)

^a FPKM = fragments per kilobase of transcript sequence per millions base pairs sequenced; SP = secretion prediction using a dedicated pipeline in this study; Nr = nonredundant protein.

^b Blastx searches against the National Center for Biotechnology Information Nr database.

pathway was also significantly enriched in infected apple leaves at 10 dpi. The products of ANM have many roles in plants, such as maintaining and repairing damaged cell walls during pathogen infection, through biosynthesis of nucleotide sugar units, which are components of the primary and secondary cell walls (Burton et al. 2010; Josè-Estanyol and Puigdomènech 2000; Wang et al. 2011; Wolf et al. 2012). Moreover, UDP-glucose, another important metabolite of the ANM pathway, can also be a substrate involved in callose biosynthesis (Chen and Kim 2009). Callose is widespread in higher plants and it plays important roles during plant development or in response to multiple stresses, especially to the infection of pathogens like rust fungi (Stone and Clarke 1992). The enhanced ANM metabolic pathway in *G. yamadae*-infected apple leaves at 10 dpi may indicate that cell-wall modification is part of the response to rust invasion at the early sporulation stage during compatible interactions.

Flavonoid, phenylpropanoid, and stilbenes are antimicrobial secondary metabolites known as phytoalexins that have long been associated with plant resistance (Ahuja et al. 2012). At 30 dpi, upregulated genes were remarkably enriched in phytoalexins biosynthesis pathways, similar to the findings of the

transcriptome analysis of apple leaves in response to *Marssonina coronaria* infection (Xu et al. 2015). Flavonoids are a widely distributed group of secondary metabolites in plants, including many components such as anthocyanidins, proanthocyanidins, flavanones, and flavonols (Treutter 2006). The flavonoid composition positively influences the type of pigments displayed in rust-infected leaves spots and the adjacent tissues, and the increased contents of flavonoid synchronized with spot expansion in apple leaves (Lu et al. 2017). Also, flavonoid biosynthesis and accumulation have been documented in poplar leaves after *Melampsora* spp. infection and biosynthesis is highly regulated by salicylic acid (Ullah et al. 2017, 2019). Accumulation of proanthocyanidins and induction in expression of genes encoding enzymes involved in the synthesis of such condensed tannins were previously reported in several transcriptome analyses of compatible poplar-poplar rust interactions (Azaiez et al. 2009; Duplessis et al. 2009; Miranda et al. 2007). The overrepresentation of flavonoid biosynthesis pathways, secondary metabolism, and pigment synthesis pathways correlates with the enlarged yellow- and red-colored area noticeable around formation of aecia by the apple rust fungus at 30 dpi. The cumulated surface of such colored area at the level of a

Table 3. (Continued from previous page)

Gene_id	Gene length	FPKM	SP	Nr description	Best blast hit (species) ^b	Accession no.
Aecia						
Cluster-17511.37981	655	1,8240.45	No	Hypothetical protein	<i>Fonsecaea pedrosoi</i> CBS 271.37	Z517_08130
Cluster-17511.38200	976	8,017.83	No	Hypothetical protein	<i>Puccinia graminis</i> f. sp. <i>tritici</i> CRL 75-36-700-3	PGTG_11079
Cluster-17511.38317	1,697	7,078.13	Yes	Differentiation-related protein 1	<i>Puccinia striiformis</i> f. sp. <i>tritici</i>	JF316700.1
Cluster-17511.38243	2,111	4,051.81	Yes	Hypothetical protein	<i>Puccinia graminis</i> f. sp. <i>tritici</i> CRL 75-36-700-3	PGTG_00898
Cluster-17511.38208	1,511	3,695.60	Yes	Secreted protein	<i>Melampsora larici-populina</i> 98AG31	Mellp1_114961
Cluster-17511.39220	1,132	3,510.75	No	Secreted protein	<i>Melampsora larici-populina</i> 98AG31	Mellp1_55804
Cluster-17511.38422	990	2,900.82	No	Hypothetical protein	<i>Melampsora larici-populina</i> 98AG31	MELLADRAFT_72416
Cluster-17511.38041	1,074	2,371.33	No	Hypothetical protein	<i>Puccinia graminis</i> f. sp. <i>tritici</i> CRL 75-36-700-3	PGTG_09216
Cluster-17511.38141	1,351	2,116.35	No	Hypothetical protein	<i>Galerina marginata</i> CBS 339.88	GALMADRAFT_24757
Cluster-17511.38023	1,412	2,015.93	No	Hypothetical protein	<i>Puccinia graminis</i> f. sp. <i>tritici</i> CRL 75-36-700-3	PGTG_19835
Cluster-17511.37610	1,676	1,939.43	No	Thiazole biosynthetic enzyme	<i>Puccinia graminis</i> f. sp. <i>tritici</i> CRL 75-36-700-3	PGTG_01304
Cluster-17511.37739	919	1,688.17	No	Hypothetical protein	<i>Puccinia graminis</i> f. sp. <i>tritici</i> CRL 75-36-700-3	PGTG_00252
Cluster-17511.38462	1,046	1,669.41	Yes	Secreted protein	<i>Melampsora larici-populina</i> 98AG31	MELLADRAFT_55804
Cluster-17511.37999	861	1,557.56	No	Hypothetical protein	<i>Melampsora larici-populina</i> 98AG31	MELLADRAFT_88098
Cluster-17511.37820	2,317	1,319.15	No	Hypothetical protein	<i>Puccinia graminis</i> f. sp. <i>tritici</i> CRL 75-36-700-3	PGTG_07544
Cluster-17511.37994	1,454	1,264.76	No	Hypothetical protein	<i>Puccinia graminis</i> f. sp. <i>tritici</i> CRL 75-36-700-3	PGTG_14957
Cluster-17511.37571	710	1,240.60	No	Hypothetical protein	<i>Puccinia graminis</i> f. sp. <i>tritici</i> CRL 75-36-700-3	PGTG_10504
Cluster-17511.37319	1,914	1,233.49	No	Hypothetical protein	<i>Puccinia graminis</i> f. sp. <i>tritici</i> CRL 75-36-700-3	PGTG_07040
Cluster-17511.38094	2,157	1,097.85	No	—	—	—
Cluster-17511.38624	2,556	1,072.20	No	Elongation factor 1-alpha	<i>Puccinia graminis</i> f. sp. <i>tritici</i> CRL 75-36-700-3	PGTG_14858
Cluster-17511.37763	877	1,052.67	No	—	—	—
Cluster-17511.38481	1,675	1,051.81	No	Hypothetical protein	<i>Absidia idahoensis</i> var. <i>thermophila</i>	LRAMOSA04894
Cluster-17511.37654	1,754	1,012.13	No	Hypothetical protein	<i>Puccinia graminis</i> f. sp. <i>tritici</i> CRL 75-36-700-3	PGTG_06229

single leaf can be remarkable and likely deeply alters the function of the leaves during successful disease establishment. However, it remains to be determined if this observation relates to a specific late defense reaction, for example, through the loosening of the biotrophic control established by the rust fungus. It is worthwhile to note that regulation of the expression of secondary metabolism genes occurs at the uredinial sporulation stage in poplar, whereas it occurs at the aecial stage in apple leaves (Lu et al. 2017; Miranda et al. 2007; Ullah et al. 2017). No particular colored reactions were noticeable on poplar leaves compared with apple leaves; however, the time frames are different in these two different types of compatible interactions (1 versus 3 weeks, for poplar uredinia and apple aecia, respectively). Altogether, our results and previous studies indicate that some of the plant responses to rust fungal infection are conserved independently of the stage or the type of rust life cycle (i.e., macrocyclic and demicyclic for the poplar rust and the apple rust fungi, respectively). Since the aecial stage is achieved on an alternate conifer host (larch) for the poplar rust fungus *M. larici-populina* (Lorrain et al. 2018), it would be particularly interesting to explore whether the secondary metabolic pathways show similar regulation patterns in different rust pathosystems with alternate hosts belonging to different taxonomical groups (i.e., angiosperms versus gymnosperms).

Transcriptome profiling of *G. yamadae* reveals expression of a conserved rust infection program and specific in-planta candidate effectors at two sporulating stages.

The large genome size of *Gymnosporangium* spp. (Tavares et al. 2014) hinders sequencing in this genus. With further efforts to obtain a reference genome for this genus (Aime et al. 2017; S. Duplessis, *personal communication*), the transcriptomes produced here and in previous studies (Tao et al. 2017, 2019) will be helpful to support genome annotation. In the absence of any supporting *G. yamadae* genome resource, a predictive annotation strategy relying on comparison with pre-existing rust genes and transcripts in databases was built after an approach described for the coffee rust fungus *H. vastatrix* (Fernandez et al. 2012), helping to identify fungal unigenes from infected apple leaves. The prediction-based method most likely overestimates the unigene numbers, with some redundancy in the dataset when expected gene numbers in rust fungi are considered (Aime et al. 2017). Nevertheless, the expression levels of *G. yamadae* transcripts were particularly high at apple infection stages spermogonia and aecia, compared with those recorded in telia in infected juniper host (Tao et al. 2017), although the total numbers of unigenes were in a similar range at these different sporulation stages. Similar to all rust genome and transcriptome reports until now, most of the transcripts expressed in spermogonia and aecia do not have a

Fig. 7. Apple phyllosphere fungal community composition in rust-inoculated and mock-inoculated conditions at 10 and 30 days postinoculation (dpi). RNA-seq reads from apple leaves unmapped to the apple genome from each biological replicate (R1 to R3) were compared with a unigenes set built from the reads of the 12 replicates altogether. The unigenes were annotated with the Joint Genome Institute MycoCosm genomic resource for attribution to fungal taxonomical genus (tax_genus) levels. **A**, Relative abundance of reads attributed to unigenes annotated in fungal taxa. **B**, Relative abundance of reads attributed to unigenes annotated in fungal taxa, after discarding rust taxa (order Pucciniales).

functional annotation and correspond to hypothetical or unknown proteins (Aime et al. 2017).

As typical heteroecious rust fungi, *Gymnosporangium* spp. need two taxonomically unrelated hosts to complete their life cycle. The resolution of transcriptome profiles in alternate hosts has, so far, been only achieved in a few rust fungi (Cuomo et al. 2017; Liu et al. 2015; Lorrain et al. 2018) and the mechanisms underlying heteroecism remain largely unknown (Aime et al. 2017; Duplessis et al. 2014). Bioinformatic prediction pipelines have been used to predict rust secretomes and identify SPs representing candidate rust effectors (Lorrain et al. 2019; Sperschneider et al. 2017). The overrepresentation of specific SPs among *M. larici-populina*-regulated genes during infection of its two different hosts suggests that such candidate effectors may underlie establishment of compatible interactions with different host plants (Lorrain et al. 2018). In apple leaves infected by *G. yamadae*, higher proportions of SPs of unknown functions were identified in telia and aecia than in spermatogonia. The expanded numbers of SPs in telia and aecia may relate to the potential roles of SPs in host alternation. *G. yamadae* SP gene families showing preferential expression during apple leaf infection in spermatogonia or aecia represent priority apple rust candidate effectors for further functional characterization to understand their precise role in pathogenesis. Beyond specific *G. yamadae* SP genes, several rust-conserved SP genes were expressed during apple infection. The haustorially expressed SP RTP1 was first identified in *Uromyces fabae* and *U. striatus*, in which it was shown to be transferred into the host cell (Kemen et al. 2005). Since, many homologs of RTP1 were found in different rust fungi, establishing a conserved rust SP gene family (Fernandez et al. 2012; Hacquard et al. 2012; Pretsch et al. 2013; Puthoff et al. 2008). Here, six unigenes retrieved in spermatogonia and aecia define new members of this ancient rust SP family. The phylogeny of the RTP family shows the existence of a specific *Gymnosporangium* spp. RTP clade, which may indicate a specific evolution in this particular fungal family in the order Pucciniales.

The distribution of expressed unigenes of the apple rust fungus in functional KOG categories shows similar overall patterns in spermatogonia and in aecia in apple tree as well as in telia on the alternate host juniper. The same conclusion was reached for *M. larici-populina* on two hosts, poplar and larch (Lorrain et al. 2018). These transcriptome studies suggest the expression of conserved molecular mechanisms in rust fungi during infection of different hosts and at different sporulation stages. Beyond the requirement of specific initial sets of effectors to bypass the host immune system, redundant genetic programs underlying the biotrophic growth may explain why rust fungi can successfully infect taxonomically unrelated alternate host plants in the same life cycle. A more systematic survey of transcriptomes expressed in alternate hosts in different pathosystems established with rust fungi from different taxonomical families is needed to validate this hypothesis.

The fungal community composition of the apple phyllosphere may be altered by rust infection.

Plant phyllosphere represents one of the largest habitats for diverse community of prokaryotic and eukaryotic microorganisms (Lindow and Brandl 2003). Some resident species are plant pathogens, but most microorganisms are nonpathogenic and have been shown to play a critical role in promoting plant growth and protecting plants against pathogens (Vorholt 2012). The fundamental roles of leaf-colonizing bacteria in plant-host fitness have been analyzed to a great extent and fungal colonizers in the phyllosphere, like their bacterial counterparts, form diverse communities and have been shown to modify disease severity in their host plants through interacting with

pathogens or activating the plant defense mechanism (Arnold et al. 2002; Busby et al. 2016; Laforest-Lapointe and Whitaker 2019). In our study, high-throughput RNA-seq has revealed the presence of fungal communities present inside or on the surface of the apple phyllosphere that are likely affected by *G. yamadae* infection. Such changes in the community composition may be due to the variation of environmental conditions (e.g., moving from indoor to outdoor in the procedure to obtain spermatogonia and aecia), or it could be due to challenge from natural microbes (Yang et al. 2016), or both. The fungal genera *Alternaria* and *Fonsecaea* presented a noticeable shift in abundance in inoculated leaf tissues at 30 dpi compared with all other conditions. Since our initial experimental design was not established to specifically survey the fungal community composition in apple leaves, our report is merely descriptive and correlative. We cannot determine whether the composition change observed at 30 dpi is due to the host reaction to rust infection, or directly from fungus biotrophic growth through challenging one or both host immunity and physiology, or both infection and growth. However, the effect of rust infection at 30 dpi is observed in the different biological replicates and it represents an interesting foundation for future studies to determine to what extent rust infection may modify the apple leaf fungal community. Many studies reported the effect of hyper-parasitic fungi on rust fungi (Kapoor and Sinha 1969; Koç and Défago 1983; Moricca et al. 2001; Tsuneda et al. 1980; Yuan et al. 1999), including one *Alternaria* species recently reported as hyper-parasites of *Puccinia striiformis* f. sp. *tritici* urediniospores (Zheng et al. 2017). The dominant position of genera *Alternaria* and *Fonsecaea* observed in *G. yamadae*-infected leaves may imply the detection of novel *G. yamadae* hyperparasites, which may act as antagonists and represent interesting new leads for biological control of apple rust disease.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Preparation of plant material and artificial inoculation.

Thirty *Malus domestica* cv. Fuji seedlings (2 years old, average 50 cm in height) were bought from the Wanlü Nursery in Nanjing, Jiangsu, China. All seedlings were planted in flower pots and were placed in the greenhouse under controlled temperature (26°C), relative humidity of 75%, and with a 12-h light and 12-h dark cycle for about one month. In early spring, *Juniperus chinensis* twigs with overwintering *G. yamadae* galls were collected in the field when mature telia extruded from the galls. The galls represent a natural inoculum, i.e., a mixture of *G. yamadae* isolates, and no other *Gymnosporangium* spp. can be confused with *G. yamadae* galls on *J. chinensis*. All these twigs were cleaned with a small brush to remove dust on the surface and were placed in a container with sterile water, overnight, to ensure germination of telia. The germination efficiency was checked under a microscope (Leica-DM3000). Basidiospores were thoroughly mixed with sterile water and were redistributed into separate sterile vials used for inoculation. Before the inoculation manipulation, all the seedlings were divided into two groups of 15 seedlings kept under dark conditions for 12 h overnight. One group was sprayed with the basidiospore solution on the top of the apple leaves and the other group was sprayed with sterile water as the mock-inoculated control. After inoculation, all seedlings were covered with plastic transparent bags in order to ensure controlled infection. All bags had openings at the top to ensure air exchange. The seedlings were placed in a chamber with a temperature of 20°C and more than 95% relative humidity for 2 days, to facilitate spore germination and penetration. Two days after inoculation, the temperature was adjusted back to room temperature (26°C) and to a relative humidity of 75%. At

10 dpi, globoid yellow spermogonia appeared on the upper surface of apple leaves. All plastic bags were then removed, and the seedlings were placed outdoors for 20 more days in order to ensure proper aecia differentiation. At 30 dpi, long tubular aecia formed on the lower surface of apple leaves. At both timepoints, three independent replicates (different leaves from different seedlings) of approximately 50 mg of diseased leaves and 50 mg of control leaves were collected simultaneously. At 10 dpi, collected samples corresponded to infected leaves with bright yellow spermogonia in the center (Fig. 1). At 30 dpi, the collected samples consisted of leaf pieces with tubular aecia in the center and discolored spots around the fungal sporulation structure. Leaf samples of similar area were collected for the mock-inoculated controls. Inoculation and sampling were performed during daytime, in April and May 2017, in Beijing (China). This experimental setup allows for direct comparisons between inoculated and mock-inoculated samples at the two stages, but environmental effects do not allow for direct comparison between timepoints. The samples were immediately frozen in liquid nitrogen and stored at -80°C until RNA isolation.

RNA isolation, cDNA library preparation and RNA-sequencing.

Apple leaves were ground to fine powder by RNase free mortars and pestles with liquid nitrogen, and the total RNA was isolated, using the RNeasy plant mini kit (Qiagen), according to manufacturer instructions. For each sample, 3 μg of RNA was used to generate sequencing library by using NEBNext UltraTM RNA library prep kit for Illumina (NEB). PCR was carried out using Phusion high-fidelity DNA polymerase, universal PCR primers, and Index (X) primer. PCR products were purified by AMPure XP system (Beckman Coulter), and the cDNA library quality was assessed on the Agilent Bioanalyzer 2100 system (Agilent Technologies). The cBot Cluster Generation System was used to cluster index-coded samples in libraries by TruSeq PE Cluster Kit v3-cBot-HS (Illumina). In each library, 150-bp paired-end reads were generated from Illumina HiSeq platform. cDNA and RNAseq library were performed at Novogene, following standard Illumina procedures. Raw reads in fastq format were first processed through in-house perl scripts to remove adapters, poly-N, and low-quality reads. The remaining high-quality clean reads were used in the subsequent analysis. All raw sequence data generated in this study has been deposited in the NCBI Sequence Read Archive (available online) under accession number SRR9326001 to SRR9326012.

Read mapping to the apple reference genome and gene expression analysis.

The reference genome and gene model annotation files of *Malus domestica* v1.0 were downloaded from Phytozome v.12. Bowtie v2.2.3 (Langmead et al. 2019) was used to build the index of the apple reference genome and paired-end clean reads were aligned to the reference genome using Tophat v2.0.12 (Trapnell et al. 2009). The mapped reads were counted, using HTSeq v0.6.1 (Anders et al. 2015), and expected number of FPKM of each gene was calculated, to estimate gene expression levels. Mapping and unigene expression estimates were performed by Novogene. The similarity between samples at the expression levels was visualized, using R package pheatmap (available online), by calculating the Pearson correlation coefficient between samples. To assess the variability among samples, PCA was performed from read counts via the plotPCA function in R package DESeq2 (Love et al. 2014). The comparisons between the transcript lists from four condition were conducted via the interactive tool Venny (available online). Differential expression

analysis between inoculated groups and mock-inoculated groups was performed by DESeq2 (Love et al. 2014), using a model based on the negative binomial distribution, and the resulting *P* values were adjusted using the Benjamini and Hochberg approach for controlling the false discovery rate. Genes with an adjusted *P* value lower than 0.05 were deemed as significantly differentially expressed.

Functional analysis of DEGs.

All significantly DEGs between inoculated and mock-inoculated conditions were classified into MapMan functional plant categories (denominated BINs), using the automated annotation pipeline Mercator 4 with default parameters (Schwacke et al. 2019). Additionally, enrichment analysis of KEGG pathways was performed by KOBAS version 2.0 (Mao et al. 2005), based on the hypergeometric test. *P* values of KEGG pathways were corrected using the Benjamini and Hochberg method. Pathways with adjusted *P* value < 0.05 were considered as significantly enriched.

Transcriptome analysis, functional annotation, secretome prediction, and sequence analysis of *G. yamadae* spermogonia and aecia.

Reads unmapped to the apple reference genome in infected groups at 10 and 30 dpi were collectively subjected to de novo assembly, using Trinity (Grabherr et al. 2011) with default parameters, which generated two transcriptomes at the two timepoints. FPKM expression levels for all unigenes were estimated in each replicate by RSEM (Li and Dewey 2011), and unigenes with FPKM > 0.3 in each library were retained for downstream analyses. All unigenes were compared with the genomes (blastn, *e*-value $\leq 10^{-5}$), predicted gene models (blastn, *e*-value $\leq 10^{-5}$), and predicted proteins (blastx, *e*-value $\leq 10^{-5}$) of the four rust fungi *Puccinia graminis* f. sp. *tritici*, *P. striiformis* f. sp. *tritici*, *P. triticina*, *Melampsora larici-populina* and the genome of the basidiomycete *Laccaria bicolor*, whose genomes are available in JGI Mycocosm (Grigoriev et al. 2014). In parallel, the unigenes were compared with 97,304 cleaned Pucciniales ESTs retrieved from dbEST at GenBank (blastn, *e*-value $\leq 10^{-5}$). Unigenes showing homology in any of the searched databases were deemed as *G. yamadae* unigenes.

The fungal unigenes were annotated using public protein databases, including the NCBI-nr protein and nucleotide databases, Swiss-Prot, KOG, Gene Ontology, protein families, KEGG Orthology, using Blastx (*e*-value $\leq 10^{-5}$). The proteomes of *G. yamadae* spermogonia and aecia stages were predicted from the corresponding unigenes using TransDecoder v3.0.1. Assignment of unigenes to rust fungi, unigene expression estimates, and annotations were performed by Novogene. A secretome prediction pipeline with a combination of bioinformatic tools, including SignalP v.4, WolfPSort, transmembrane hidden Markov model (HMM), TargetP, and PS-Scan algorithms, was used to predict SPs, as described by Pellegrin et al. (2015). Candidate CAZymes, proteases, and lipases were annotated in the predicted secretomes, using the dbCAN v2.0 HMM-based CAZy annotation server (Zhang et al. 2018), Merops (Rawlings et al. 2016) and the Lipase Engineering database (Fischer and Pleiss 2003), respectively. The three proteomes predicted from *G. yamadae* spermogonia and aecia from this study and from *G. yamadae* telia (Tao et al. 2017) were used for comparison by MCL analysis. Gene families were clustered with fastOrtho MCL v12.135 (Wattam et al. 2014), using inflation parameters of 3 and 50% identity and coverage. Spermogonia and aecia RTP homologs were retrieved from the annotation files and were aligned with selected RTP homologs from rust fungi found in NCBI with the

Omega cluster (Madeira et al. 2019), and the UPGMA (un-weighted pair group method with arithmetic means) tree was done with MAFFT v6.864.

Identification of fungal community of the apple phyllosphere through a metatranscriptomic approach.

The metatranscriptomic analysis was run separately to the transcriptome analysis, using a dedicated approach and a distinct bioinformatic pipeline. First, all Illumina reads from the different replicate samples were trimmed and mapped onto the *M. domestica* reference genome using CLC Genomics Workbench 11.0 (Qiagen S.A.S. France). A systematic trimming of 15 and 10 nucleotides at the 5' and 3' ends, respectively, of all Illumina reads was applied, followed by mapping onto the apple genome (CLC "map reads to reference" procedure with default parameters, except for length and similarity fractions, each set at 0.8). The final numbers of unmapped reads were in the same range than those of the transcriptome analysis. Paired end reads unmapped onto the apple reference genome from all samples were used altogether to perform a de novo coassembly, using Megahit version 1.1.3 with default parameters (Li et al. 2015) and contigs smaller than 500 bp were discarded. Reads of each sample were then mapped on the selected contigs using bowtie version 2.3.0 (Langmead and Salzberg 2012). Counts were determined using SAMtools version 1.7 (Li et al. 2009). Contigs supported by fewer than three samples and fewer than five counts were discarded. The remaining contigs were annotated using a blast-like procedure using DIAMOND version 0.9.19 (Buchfink et al. 2015), with the parameters more sensitive—max-target-seqs 1—max-hsps 1—evalue 0.00001, and JGI MycoCosm predicted proteins from fungal genomes (deposited before July 2018) as a reference database. Diamond annotation was doubled using NCBI-nr (March 2018 version) to check for fungal false positives and attribution to other kingdoms, based on the comparison between MycoCosm and nr best hit scores. Count tables and annotations for phyllosphere fungal composition were then analyzed at various taxonomical levels using R version 3.4.3 and packages dplyR and ggplot2. Taxonomical category "others" corresponds to taxa with a relative abundance below 10^{-3} in all samples.

AUTHOR-RECOMMENDED INTERNET RESOURCES

Clustal Omega: <https://www.ebi.ac.uk/Tools/msa/clustalo>
 JGI MycoCosm: <https://mycocosm.jgi.doe.gov/mycocosm/home>
 MAFFT v6.864: <https://www.genome.jp/tools-bin/mafft>
 NCBI Sequence Read Archive: <https://submit.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/subs/sra>
 R package pheatmap: <https://cran.r-project.org/web/packages/pheatmap/index.html>
 Phytozome v.12: <https://phytozome.jgi.doe.gov/pz/portal.html>
 Venny: <https://bioinfogp.cnb.csic.es/tools/venny/index.html>

LITERATURE CITED

Agler, M. T., Ruhe, J., Kroll, S., Morhenn, C., Kim, S. T., Weigel, D., and Kemen, E. M. 2016. Microbial hub taxa link host and abiotic factors to plant microbiome variation. *PLoS Biol.* 14:e1002352.
 Ahuja, I., Kissen, R., and Bones, A. M. 2012. Phytoalexins in defense against pathogens. *Trends Plant Sci.* 17:73-90.
 Aime, M. C., McTaggart, A. R., Mondo, S. J., and Duplessis, S. 2017. Phylogenetics and phylogenomics of rust fungi. *Adv. Genet.* 100: 267-307.
 Anders, S., Pyl, P. T., and Huber, W. 2015. HTSeq—A Python framework to work with high-throughput sequencing data. *Bioinformatics* 31:166-169.
 Arnold, A. E., Maynard, Z., Gilbert, G. S., Coley, P. D., and Kursar, T. A. 2002. Are tropical fungal endophytes hyperdiverse. *Ecol. Lett.* 3:267-274.
 Azaiez, A., Boyle, B., Levée, V., and Séguin, A. 2009. Transcriptome profiling in hybrid poplar following interactions with *Melampsora* rust fungi. *Mol. Plant-Microbe Interact* 22:190-200.

Becker, R., Behrendt, U., Hommel, B., Kropf, S., and Ulrich, A. 2008. Effects of transgenic fructan-producing potatoes on the community structure of rhizosphere and phyllosphere bacteria. *FEMS Microbiol. Ecol.* 66:411-425.
 Buchfink, B., Xie, C., and Huson, D. H. 2015. Fast and sensitive protein alignment using DIAMOND. *Nat. Methods* 12:59-60.
 Burton, R. A., Gidley, M. J., and Fincher, G. B. 2010. Heterogeneity in the chemistry, structure and function of plant cell walls. *Nat. Chem. Biol.* 6: 724-732.
 Busby, P. E., Peay, K. G., and Newcombe, G. 2016. Common foliar fungi of *Populus trichocarpa* modify *Melampsora* rust disease severity. *New Phytol.* 209:1681-1692.
 Camatti-Sartori, V., da Silva-Ribeiro, R. T., Valdebenito-Sanhueza, R. M., Pagnocca, F. C., Echeverrigaray, S., and Azevedo, J. L. 2005. Endophytic yeasts and filamentous fungi associated with southern Brazilian apple (*Malus domestica*) orchards subjected to conventional, integrated or organic cultivation. *J. Basic Microbiol.* 45:397-402.
 Chen, X. Y., and Kim, J. Y. 2009. Callose synthesis in higher plants. *Plant Signal. Behav.* 4:489-492.
 Cummins, G., and Hiratsuka, Y. 2003. Illustrated genera of rust fungi. Pages 1-225 in: *Illustrated Genera of Rust Fungi*. APS Press, St Paul, MN, U.S.A.
 Cuomo, C. A., Bakkeren, G., Khalil, H. B., Panwar, V., Joly, D., Linning, R., Sakthikumar, S., Song, X., Adiconis, X., Fan, L., Goldberg, J. M., Levin, J. Z., Young, S., Zeng, Q., Anikster, Y., Bruce, M., Wang, M., Yin, C., McCallum, B., Szabo, L. J., Hulbert, S., Chen, X., and Fellers, J. P. 2017. Comparative analysis highlights variable genome content of wheat rusts and divergence of the mating loci. *G3 (Bethesda)* 7:361-376.
 Dobon, A., Bunting, D. C. E., Cabrera-Quio, L. E., Uauy, C., and Saunders, D. G. O. 2016. The host-pathogen interaction between wheat and yellow rust induces temporally coordinated waves of gene expression. *BMC Genomics* 17:380.
 Duplessis, S., Bakkeren, G., and Hamelin, R. 2014. Advancing knowledge on biology of rust fungi through genomics. *Adv. Bot. Res.* 70:173-209.
 Duplessis, S., Major, I., Martin, F., and Séguin, A. 2009. Poplar and pathogen interactions: Insights from *Populus* genome-wide analyses of resistance and defense gene families and expression profiling of poplar leaves upon infection with rust. *Crit. Rev. Plant Sci.* 28:309-334.
 Fernandez, D., Tisserant, E., Talhinas, P., Azinheira, H., Vieira, A., Petitot, A. S., Loureiro, A., Poulain, J., Da Silva, C., Silva, M. C., and Duplessis, S. 2012. 454-pyrosequencing of *Coffea arabica* leaves infected by the rust fungus *Hemileia vastatrix* reveals in planta-expressed pathogen-secreted proteins and plant functions in a late compatible plant-rust interaction. *Mol. Plant Pathol.* 13:17-37.
 Fischer, M., and Pleiss, J. 2003. The lipase engineering database: A navigation and analysis tool for protein families. *Nucleic Acids Res.* 31: 319-321.
 Grabherr, M. G., Haas, B. J., Yassour, M., Levin, J. Z., Thompson, D. A., Amit, I., Adiconis, X., Fan, L., Raychowdhury, R., Zeng, Q., Chen, Z., Mauceli, E., Hacohen, N., Gnirke, A., Rhind, N., di Palma, F., Birren, B. W., Nusbaum, C., Lindblad-Toh, K., Friedman, N., and Regev, A. 2011. Full-length transcriptome assembly from RNA-Seq data without a reference genome. *Nat. Biotechnol.* 29:644-652.
 Grigoriev, I. V., Nikitin, R., Haridas, S., Kuo, A., Ohm, R., Otillar, R., Riley, R., Salamov, A., Zhao, X., Korzeniewski, F., Smirnova, T., Nordberg, H., Dubchak, I., and Shabalov, I. 2014. MycoCosm portal: Gearing up for 1000 fungal genomes. *Nucleic Acids Res.* 42 (D1):D699-D704.
 Gullner, G., Komives, T., Király, L., and Schröder, P. 2018. Glutathione S-transferase enzymes in plant-pathogen interactions. *Front. Plant Sci.* 9: 1836.
 Guo, Y. N. 1994. The integrated management of the rust of apple (*Gymnosporangium yamadai* Miyabe). *Bull. Agric. Sci. Technol.* 19: 28-29 (In Chinese).
 Hacquard, S., Joly, D. L., Lin, Y. C., Tisserant, E., Feau, N., Delaruelle, C., Legue, V., Kohloer, A., Tanguay, P., Petre, B., Frey, P., Van de Peer, Y., Rouzé, P., Martin, F. M., Hamelin, R. C., and Duplessis, S. 2012. A comprehensive analysis of genes encoding small secreted proteins identifies candidate effectors in *Melampsora larici-populina* (poplar leaf rust). *Mol. Plant-Microbe Interact.* 25:279-293.
 Harada, Y. 1984. Pear and apple rusts in Japan, with special reference to their life cycles and host ranges. *Rep. Tottori Mycol. Inst.* 22:108-119.
 Hassani, M. A., Durán, P., and Hacquard, S. 2018. Microbial interactions within the plant holobiont. *Microbiome* 6:58.
 José-Estanyol, M., and Puigdomènech, P. 2000. Plant cell wall glycoproteins and their genes. *Plant Physiol. Biochem.* 38:97-108.
 Kapooria, R. G., and Sinha, S. 1969. Phylloplane mycoflora of pearl millet and its influence on the development of *Puccinia penniseti*. *Trans. Br. Mycol. Soc.* 53:153-155.

- Kawahara, Y., Oono, Y., Kanamori, H., Matsumoto, T., Itoh, T., and Minami, E. 2012. Simultaneous RNA-seq analysis of a mixed transcriptome of rice and blast fungus interaction. *PLoS One* 7:e49423.
- Kemen, A. C., Agler, M. T., and Kemen, E. 2015. Host-microbe and microbe-microbe interactions in the evolution of obligate plant parasitism. *New Phytol.* 206:1207-1228.
- Kemen, E., Kemen, A. C., Rafiqi, M., Hempel, U., Mendgen, K., Hahn, M., and Voegelé, R. T. 2005. Identification of a protein from rust fungi transferred from haustoria into infected plant cells. *Mol. Plant-Microbe Interact* 18:1130-1139.
- Kern, F. D. 1973. A revised taxonomic account of *Gymnosporangium*. Pennsylvania State University Press, University Park, U.S.A.
- Kim, S. C., and Kim, C. H. 1980. Studies on the disease of pear rust caused by *Gymnosporangium haraeaeum* Sydow. I: Some ecological investigation of inoculum source. *Korean J. Plant Pathol.* 19:39-44.
- Koç, N. K., and Défago, G. 1983. Studies on the host range of the hyperparasite *Aphanocladium album*. *J. Phytopathol.* 107:214-218.
- Laforest-Lapointe, I., and Whitaker, B. K. 2019. Decrypting the phyllosphere microbiota: Progress and challenges. *Am. J. Bot.* 106:171-173.
- Lallement, P. A., Brouwer, B., Keech, O., Hecker, A., and Rouhier, N. 2014. The still mysterious roles of cysteine-containing glutathione transferases in plants. *Front. Pharmacol.* 5:192.
- Langmead, B., and Salzberg, S. L. 2012. Fast gapped-read alignment with Bowtie 2. *Nat. Methods* 9:357-359.
- Langmead, B., Wilks, C., Antonescu, V., and Charles, R. 2019. Scaling read aligners to hundreds of threads on general-purpose processors. *Bioinformatics* 35:421-432.
- Leveau, J. H. J., and Tech, J. J. 2011. Grapevine microbiomics: Bacterial diversity on grape leaves and berries revealed by high-throughput sequence analysis of 16S rRNA amplicons. *Acta Hort.* 905:31-42.
- Li, B., and Dewey, C. N. 2011. RSEM: Accurate transcript quantification from RNA-Seq data with or without a reference genome. *BMC Bioinformatics* 12:323.
- Li, D., Liu, C.-M., Luo, R., Sadakane, K., and Lam, T. W. 2015. MEGAHIT: An ultra-fast single-node solution for large and complex metagenomics assembly via succinct de Bruijn graph. *Bioinformatics* 31:1674-1676.
- Li, H., Handsaker, B., Wysoker, A., Fennell, T., Ruan, J., Homer, N., Marth, G., Abecasis, G., and Durbin, R. 1000 Genome Project Data Processing Subgroup. 2009. The sequence alignment/map format and SAMtools. *Bioinformatics* 25:2078-2079.
- Lindow, S. E., and Brandl, M. T. 2003. Microbiology of the phyllosphere. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* 69:1875-1883.
- Liu, J.-J., Sturrock, R. N., Snieszko, R. A., Williams, H., Benton, R., and Zamany, A. 2015. Transcriptome analysis of the white pine blister rust pathogen *Cronartium ribicola*: De novo assembly, expression profiling, and identification of candidate effectors. *BMC Genomics* 16:678.
- Lorrain, C., Gonçalves Dos Santos, K. C., Germain, H., Hecker, A., and Duplessis, S. 2019. Advances in understanding obligate biotrophy in rust fungi. *New Phytol.* 222:1190-1206.
- Lorrain, C., Marchal, C., Hacquard, S., Delaruelle, C., Pétrowski, J., Petre, B., Hecker, A., Frey, P., and Duplessis, S. 2018. The rust fungus *Melampsora larici-populina* expresses a conserved genetic program and distinct sets of secreted protein genes during infection of its two host plants, larch and poplar. *Mol. Plant-Microbe Interact* 31:695-706.
- Love, M. I., Huber, W., and Anders, S. 2014. Moderated estimation of fold change and dispersion for RNA-seq data with DESeq2. *Genome Biol.* 15:550.
- Lu, Y., Chen, Q., Bu, Y., Luo, R., Hao, S., Zhang, J., Tian, J., and Yao, Y. 2017. Flavonoid accumulation plays an important role in the rust resistance of *Malus* plant leaves. *Front. Plant Sci.* 8:1286.
- Madeira, F., Park, Y. M., Lee, J., Buso, N., Gur, T., Madhusoodanan, N., Basutkar, P., Tivey, A. R. N., Potter, S. C., Finn, R. D., and Lopez, R. 2019. The EMBL-EBI search and sequence analysis tools APIs in 2019. *Nucleic Acids Res.* 47 (W1):W636-W641.
- Mao, X., Cai, T., Olyarchuk, J. G., and Wei, L. 2005. Automated genome annotation and pathway identification using the KEGG Orthology (KO) as a controlled vocabulary. *Bioinformatics* 21:3787-3793.
- Miranda, M., Ralph, S. G., Mellway, R., White, R., Heath, M. C., Bohlmann, J., and Constabel, C. P. 2007. The transcriptional response of hybrid poplar (*Populus trichocarpa* x *P. deltoides*) to infection by *Melampsora medusae* leaf rust involves induction of flavonoid pathway genes leading to the accumulation of proanthocyanidins. *Mol. Plant-Microbe Interact* 20:816-831.
- Moricca, S., Ragazzi, A., Mitchelson, K. R., and Assante, G. 2001. Antagonism of the two-needle pine stem rust fungi *Cronartium flaccidum* and *Peridermium pini* by *Cladosporium tenuissimum* in vitro and in planta. *Phytopathology* 91:457-468.
- Pégeot, H., Koh, C. S., Petre, B., Mathiot, S., Duplessis, S., Hecker, A., Didierjean, C., and Rouhier, N. 2014. The poplar Phi class glutathione transferase: Expression, activity and structure of GSTF1. *Front. Plant Sci.* 5:712.
- Pellegrin, C., Morin, E., Martin, F. M., and Veneault-Fourrey, C. 2015. Comparative analysis of secretomes from ectomycorrhizal fungi with an emphasis on small-secreted proteins. *Front. Microbiol.* 6:1278.
- Peterson, R. S. 1967. Studies of juniper rusts. *Madrono* 19:79-91.
- Petre, B., Joly, D. L., and Duplessis, S. 2014. Effector proteins of rust fungi. *Front. Plant Sci.* 5:416.
- Pretsch, K., Kemen, A., Kemen, E., Geiger, M., Mendgen, K., and Voegelé, R. 2013. The rust transferred proteins-a new family of effector proteins exhibiting protease inhibitor function. *Mol. Plant Pathol.* 14:96-107.
- Puthoff, D. P., Neelam, A., Ehrenfried, M. L., Scheffler, B. E., Ballard, L., Song, Q., Campbell, K. B., Cooper, B., and Tucker, M. L. 2008. Analysis of expressed sequence tags from *Uromyces appendiculatus* hyphae and haustoria and their comparison to sequences from other rust fungi. *Phytopathology* 98:1126-1135.
- Rawlings, N. D., Barrett, A. J., and Finn, R. 2016. Twenty years of the MEROPS database of proteolytic enzymes, their substrates and inhibitors. *Nucleic Acids Res.* 44 (D1):D343-D350.
- Reisberg, E. E., Hildebrandt, U., Riederer, M., and Hentschel, U. 2012. Phyllosphere bacterial communities of trichome-bearing and trichomeless *Arabidopsis thaliana* leaves. *Antonie van Leeuwenhoek* 101:551-560.
- Rinaldi, C., Kohler, A., Frey, P., Duchaussoy, F., Ningre, N., Couloux, A., Wincker, P., Le Thiec, D., Fluch, S., Martin, F., and Duplessis, S. 2007. Transcript profiling of poplar leaves upon infection with compatible and incompatible strains of the foliar rust *Melampsora larici-populina*. *Plant Physiol.* 144:347-366.
- Ritpitakphong, U., Falquet, L., Vimoltust, A., Berger, A., Métraux, J.-P., and L'Haridon, F. 2016. The microbiome of the leaf surface of *Arabidopsis* protects against a fungal pathogen. *New Phytol.* 210:1033-1043.
- Schneider, K. T., van de Mortel, M., Bancroft, T. J., Braun, E., Nettleton, D., Nelson, R. T., Frederick, R. D., Baum, T. J., Graham, M. A., and Whitham, S. A. 2011. Biphasic gene expression changes elicited by *Phakopsora pachyrhizi* in soybean correlate with fungal penetration and haustoria formation. *Plant Physiol.* 157:355-371.
- Schwacke, R., Ponce-Soto, G. Y., Krause, K., Bolger, A. M., Arsova, B., Hallab, A., Gruden, K., Stitt, M., Bolger, M. E., and Usadel, B. 2019. MapMan4: A refined protein classification and annotation framework applicable to multi-omics data analysis. *Mol. Plant* 12:879-892.
- Sperschneider, J., Dodds, P. N., Taylor, J. M., and Duplessis, S. 2017. Computational methods for predicting effectors in rust pathogens. *Methods Mol. Biol.* 1659:73-83.
- Stone, B. A., and Clarke, A. E. 1992. Chemistry and Biology of (1-3)- β -D-Glucans. La Trobe University Press, Victoria, Australia.
- Struck, C. 2015. Amino acid uptake in rust fungi. *Front. Plant Sci.* 6:40.
- Tao, S.-Q., Cao, B., Morin, E., Liang, Y.-M., and Duplessis, S. 2019. Comparative transcriptomics of *Gymnosporangium* spp. teliospores reveals a conserved genetic program at this specific stage of the rust fungal life cycle. *BMC Genomics* 20:723.
- Tao, S.-Q., Cao, B., Tian, C.-M., and Liang, Y.-M. 2017. Comparative transcriptome analysis and identification of candidate effectors in two related rust species (*Gymnosporangium yamadae* and *Gymnosporangium asiaticum*). *BMC Genomics* 18:651.
- Tao, S.-Q., Cao, B., Tian, C.-M., and Liang, Y.-M. 2018. Development and characterization of novel genic-SSR markers in apple-Juniper rust pathogen *Gymnosporangium yamadae* (Pucciniales: Pucciniaceae) using next-generation sequencing. *Int. J. Mol. Sci.* 19:1178.
- Tavares, S., Ramos, A. P., Pires, A. S., Azinheira, H. G., Caldeirinha, P., Link, T., Abranches, R., Silva, M. C., Voegelé, R. T., Loureiro, J., and Talhahas, P. 2014. Genome size analyses of Pucciniales reveal the largest fungal genomes. *Front. Plant Sci.* 5:422.
- Teixeira, P. J. P. L., Thomazella, D. P. T., Reis, O., do Prado, P. F. V., do Rio, M. C. S., Fiorin, G. L., José, J., Costa, G. G. L., Negri, V. A., Mondego, J. M. C., Mieczkowski, P., and Pereira, G. A. G. 2014. High-resolution transcript profiling of the atypical biotrophic interaction between *Theobroma cacao* and the fungal pathogen *Moniliophthora perniciosa*. *Plant Cell* 26:4245-4269.
- Trapnell, C., Pachter, L., and Salzberg, S. L. 2009. TopHat: Discovering splice junctions with RNA-Seq. *Bioinformatics* 25:1105-1111.
- Treutter, D. 2006. Significance of flavonoids in plant resistance: A review. *Environ. Chem. Lett.* 4:147-157.
- Tsunedo, A., Hiratsuka, Y., and Maruyama, P. J. 1980. Hyperparasitism of *Scytalidium uedinicola* on western gall rust, *Endocronartium harknessii*. *Can. J. Bot.* 58:1154-1159.

- Ullah, C., Tsai, C. J., Unsicker, S. B., Xue, L., Reichelt, M., Gershenzon, J., and Hammerbacher, A. 2019. Salicylic acid activates poplar defense against the biotrophic rust fungus *Melampsora larici-populina* via increased biosynthesis of catechin and proanthocyanidins. *New Phytol.* 221:960-975.
- Ullah, C., Unsicker, S. B., Fellenberg, C., Constabel, C. P., Schmidt, A., Gershenzon, J., and Hammerbacher, A. 2017. Flavan-3-ols are an effective chemical defense against rust infection. *Plant Physiol.* 175: 1560-1578.
- van de Mortel, M., Recknor, J. C., Graham, M. A., Nettleton, D., Dittman, J. D., Nelson, R. T., Godoy, C. V., Abdelnoor, R. V., Almeida, A. M., Baum, T. J., and Whitham, S. A. 2007. Distinct biphasic mRNA changes in response to Asian soybean rust infection. *Mol. Plant-Microbe Interact* 20:887-899.
- Velasco, R., Zharkikh, A., Affourtit, J., Dhingra, A., Cestaro, A., Kalyanaraman, A., Fontana, P., Bhatnagar, S. K., Troggio, M., Pruss, D., Salvi, S., Pindo, M., Baldi, P., Castelletti, S., Cavaiuolo, M., Coppola, G., Costa, F., Cova, V., Dal Ri, A., Goremykin, V., Komjanc, M., Longhi, S., Magnago, P., Malacarne, G., Malnoin, M., Micheletti, D., Moretto, M., Perazzolli, M., Siammour, A., Vezzulli, S., Zini, E., Eldredge, G., Fitzgerald, L. M., Gutin, N., Lanchbury, J., Macalma, T., Mitchell, J. T., Reid, J., Wardell, B., Kodira, C., Chen, Z., Desany, B., Niazi, F., Palmer, M., Koepke, T., Jiwan, D., Schaeffer, S., Krishnan, V., Wu, C., Chu, V.-T., King, S. T., Vick, J., Tao, Q., Mraz, A., Stormo, A., Stormo, K., Bogden, R., Ederle, D., Stella, A., Vecchietti, A., Kater, M. M., Masiero, S., Lasserre, P., Lespinasse, Y., Allan, A. C., Bus, V., Chagné, D., Crowhurst, R. N., Gleave, A. P., Lavezzo, E., Fawcett, J. A., Proost, S., Rouzé, P., Sterck, L., Toppo, S., Lazzari, B., Hellens, R. P., Durel, C. E., Gutin, A., Bumgarner, R. E., Gardiner, S. E., Skolnick, M., Egholm, M., Van de Peer, Y., Salamini, F., and Viola, R. 2010. The genome of the domesticated apple (*Malus × domestica* Borkh.). *Nat. Genet.* 42:833-839.
- Voegele, R. T., and Hahn, M., and Mendgen, K. 2009. The Uredinales: Cytology, biochemistry, and molecular biology. Pages 69-98 in: *Plant relationships. The Mycota (A comprehensive treatise on fungi as experimental systems for basic and applied research)*. H. B. Deising, ed. Springer, Berlin.
- Vogel, C., Bodenhausen, N., Gruissem, W., and Vorholt, J. A. 2016. The *Arabidopsis* leaf transcriptome reveals distinct but also overlapping responses to colonization by phyllosphere commensals and pathogen infection with impact on plant health. *New Phytol.* 212:192-207.
- Vorholt, J. A. 2012. Microbial life in the phyllosphere. *Nat. Rev. Microbiol.* 10:828-840.
- Wang, Q., Zhang, X., Li, F., Hou, Y., Liu, X., and Zhang, X. 2011. Identification of a UDP-glucose pyrophosphorylase from cotton (*Gossypium hirsutum* L.) involved in cellulose biosynthesis in *Arabidopsis thaliana*. *Plant Cell Rep.* 30:1303-1312.
- Wang, S.-Q., Yang, Z.-P., and Yu, J. 2010. The reasons that apple rust happens seriously and comprehensive prevention and control measures. *China Gard.* 26:145-146 (In Chinese).
- Wattam, A. R., Abraham, D., Dalay, O., Disz, T. L., Driscoll, T., Gabbard, J. L., Gillespie, J. J., Gough, R., Hix, D., Kenyon, R., Machi, D., Mao, C., Nordberg, E. K., Olson, R., Overbeek, R., Pusch, G. D., Shukla, M., Schulman, J., Stevens, R. L., Sullivan, D. E., Vonstein, V., Warren, A., Will, R., Wilson, M. J., Yoo, H. S., Zhang, C., Zhang, Y., and Sobral, B. W. 2014. PATRIC, the bacterial bioinformatics database and analysis resource. *Nucleic Acids Res.* 42 (D1):D581-D591.
- Westermann, A. J., Barquist, L., and Vogel, J. 2017. Resolving host-pathogen interactions by dual RNA-seq. *PLoS Pathog.* 13:e1006033.
- Wolf, S., Hématy, K., and Höfte, H. 2012. Growth control and cell wall signaling in plants. *Annu. Rev. Plant Biol.* 63:381-407.
- Xu, J., Li, M., Jiao, P., Tao, H., Wei, N., Ma, F., and Zhang, J. 2015. Dynamic transcription profiles of “Qinguan” apple (*Malus × domestica*) leaves in response to *Marssonina coronaria* inoculation. *Front. Plant Sci.* 6:842.
- Yang, T., Sun, H., Shen, C., and Chu, H. 2016. Fungal assemblages in different habitats in an Erman’s birch forest. *Front. Microbiol.* 7:1368.
- Yuan, Z. M., Hunter, T., Ruiz, C., and Royle, D. J. 1999. Pathogenicity to willow rust, *melampsora epitea*, of the mycoparasite *sphaerellopsis filum* from different sources. *Mycol. Res.* 103:509-512.
- Yun, H. Y., Lee, S. K., and Lee, K. J. 2005. Identification of aecial host ranges of four Korean *Gymnosporangium* species based on the artificial inoculation with teliospores obtained from various forms of telia. *Plant Pathol. J.* 21:310-316.
- Zhang, H., Yohe, T., Huang, L., Entwistle, S., Wu, P., Yang, Z., Busk, P. K., Xu, Y., and Yin, Y. 2018. dbCAN2: A meta server for automated carbohydrate-active enzyme annotation. *Nucleic Acids Res.* 46 (W1):W95-W101.
- Zheng, L., Zhao, J., Liang, X., Zhan, G., Jiang, S., and Kang, Z. 2017. Identification of a novel *Alternaria alternata* strain able to hyperparasitize *Puccinia striiformis* f. sp. *tritici*, the causal agent of wheat stripe rust. *Front. Microbiol.* 8:71.